

**Lancet –UiO Commission on
Global Governance for Health**

in collaboration with the Harvard Institute of Global Health

**Executive Summary Report of
the Third Meeting**

New Delhi, 8 -10 November 2012

Executive summary

Background

The main background document for the Delhi meeting was a Zero Draft of the Commission Report. The draft included overall themes identified as of importance by the Commission at the first and second meetings, and preliminary observations from empirical and analytical work done by the Resource Group.

The Commission was invited by the Vice-Chair, Jashodhara Dasgupta, to convene in India for its third meeting. While being an emerging economy that increasingly plays a larger role in global negotiations and having a vibrant democracy and a flourishing civil society, India is still struggling to achieve meaningful improvements in social development indicators. This became clear during the pre-commission meeting seminar on November 8, where representatives from India's vibrant civil society presented cases of peoples' responses to global governance challenges, such as providing equitable access to medicines, ensuring food security and holding transnational corporations liable for actions inflicting on peoples health and wellbeing. The combination of a transforming economy and vulnerable local populations exemplifies clearly the challenges with which the Commission is grappling.

Goals for the Commission Meeting

Two goals were suggested by the Secretariat prior to the meeting. The first was to start developing recommendations. The second goal was to decide on how to move forward with the Zero Draft. The direction of revisions would need to point at both form and substance, moving towards conceptual clarity as well as identifying additional research needs to support the development of recommendations.

Structure of the Meeting

The meeting was introduced by a one day seminar on November 8, to share experiences and perspectives from India, through five case studies of high relevance to the Commission. In the evening the same day, a public lecture on contemporary challenges and India's role in global governance for health was given by the Indian Hon. Minister of Rural Development, Mr. Jairam Ramesh. Dr. Syeda Hameed, member in charge of health at the Indian Planning Commission, chaired the session, and Ole Petter Ottersen and Jashodhara Dasgupta were participants in the panel. In total, more than 80 guests from Indian media, NGOs, academia, government and foreign services attended the public lecture together with the Commissioners. The seminar and the public lecture set the stage for the meeting, providing profound reference points and grounding for the Commission's deliberation the following two days (9-10 November). All discussions during the Commission meeting were in plenary. As was set out in the agenda (annex 1), three commission members (Nkosana Moyo, Desmond McNeill and Sakiko Fukuda Parr) were asked to introduce identified topics for discussion. Gorik Ooms, Sigrun Møgedal and Nkosana Moyo presented in addition sample recommendations for discussion during the second day of the meeting.¹

¹ See Annex for Agenda and List of Participants.

Key Outcomes of Deliberations

Working title

A new working title has been proposed: “Harnessing Global Forces for Health”. Harnessing means to curtail but also to exploit, utilize, control, use, employ, make use of, put to use, channel, mobilize, apply, and capitalize on. The title may thereby capture the Commission’s wish to mobilize opportunities in addition to channeling the challenges of global governance for health. The working title gained support within the Commission, but is still up for discussion, or refinements and better ideas are welcome until the 5th Commission meeting in Oslo, April 2013. Its function should be to capture the essential message of the Commission.

The Commission’s process for the next phase

The Commission’s task and its work process are multilayered. Crafting of recommendations will be undertaken parallel to the research underpinning the recommendations. While the research may drive development of recommendations, it may also function in an iterative process, by supporting, or investigating the feasibility of recommendations that are proposed by the Commission.

The Commission’s discussions have had a strong focus on “the Whys”, which has led the work down a political path. To avoid the risk that the recommendations will be more managerial than inspirational, an advocacy role for the Commission was suggested: “We must take an identifying approach where we can influence action to moderate, and second is the strong advocacy to lay bare the challenges and that we put out a report that catalyzes action of people who try to deal with the challenges”. A balance between what is possible and what is ideal and inspirational thus needs to be struck.

The Commission’s function, key messages and target audience

Based on the global governance tools and mechanisms identified in the work of the Research Group (zero draft, table 1, p.13), it was agreed that the function of the Global Commission on Global Governance for Health lies in its capability to *frame the problem, set the agenda and suggest priorities*. In recognition of these functions, a range of actors with power to take action with the agenda will be targeted within the Commission’s messages:

It was agreed to work towards three main messages at three levels; the first expressing why the Commission’s work is important, the second indicates which global governance arrangements, or lack of such, constitute the most important global determinants of health and the third suggesting how to do something about it by offering concrete options for immediate action.

- Message 1: A call for a paradigm shift about health, injustice and global action (framing)
- Message 2: An outline of the major determinants of health requiring global governance responses (setting the agenda)
- Message 3: Specific policy proposals for immediate consideration (prioritizing action)

The value claim (Message 1)

The Commission decided not to settle for a single common value as the base for its work. A collective recognition among the Commissioners that “some things are simply unacceptable” was expressed, and the concepts of social injustice, human rights, and human development were put forward as sensible value claims. The concepts should be used rigorously and appropriately, but without being drawn into the details of, for instance, a Human Rights Framework. The Commission was open for that other concepts may be added, such as Human Security or Human Development, but that the Commission should promote some values, like human dignity and freedom that may capture a common motivation for the different concepts. “Solidarity” and

“Peace” also entered the discussion for the first time as values for the Commission’s consideration.

The issues - The major determinants of health (Message 2)

Although the report on social determinants of health is used as a platform, the Commission has a clear political and global perspective. Seven areas of concern related to various sectors relevant in global governance were suggested as the major determinants of health that require global solutions:

1. Trade agreements that conflict with public health objectives
2. Volatility of global commodity markets
3. Unregulated activities of global corporations that threaten health
4. Inadequate global responses to violent political conflict
5. Missing global goods due to lack of investment in technologies that address enduring problems of poverty
6. Financial market volatility. (See Message 2 in 4.1.)
7. Inadequate distribution of knowledge, expertise and other common public goods

The recommendations (Message 3)

The final recommendations of the Commission will be generated through two pathways; through the Commissioners’ proposals and through the discussions on the research work as it proceeds. It was requested that the policy proposals should take shape as messages “put out there for someone to develop or work out”.

Annexes

1. Agenda

The Lancet – University of Oslo Commission
on Global Governance for Health

In Collaboration with Harvard Global Health Institute

- Third Meeting –

The Claridges Hotel, New Delhi

08. – 10. November 2012

Agenda

7th November – *Arrival*

20:00 Buffet Dinner at The Claridges Hotel for those who have arrived

8th November – *Pre-Commission Meeting*

09:00 – 09:30	Welcome by Ole Petter Ottersen, Rector at the University of Oslo and Jashodhara Dasgupta, Coordinator of SAHAYOG Society	The Senate, 1 st Floor
09:30 – 10:15	Inaugural Address by Advocate Anand Grover, UN Special Rapporteur on the Right to Health	
10:15 – 10:30	Break with refreshments	
10:30 – 10:45	Introduction of cases and how they relate to the Commission's work	

10:45 -12:15	Case presentations with Q/A <i>A. The effects of GM crops: global interests and local response in India (PM Bhargava)</i> <i>B. Between a rock and a hard place: resisting commercial interests in malnutrition (Dr. Vandana Prasad)</i>
12:15 – 13:30	Lunch
13.30 – 15:00	Case presentations with Q/A <i>C. The socio-political question of access to medicines (Leena Menghaney & Gopakumar)</i> <i>D. Corporate liabilities and the case of the Bhopal gas leak disaster (Sathyu Sarangi)</i>
15:00 – 15:15	Break with refreshments
15:15 – 15:45	Case presentations with Q/A <i>E. Issues and challenges in reproductive tourism (Sarojini NB)</i>
15:45 – 16:30	Participants' reflections How to draw upon the information from these cases when considering what role values, interests and power play in global governance?
17:30	Departure from the Claridges Hotel to the India Habitat Centre

Evening program on Thursday 8th November at The India Habitat Centre

A public lecture on "Global Governance for Health: Contemporary Challenges and India's Role" will be organized in the evening (around 6.30pm) of the 8th. The Hon. Minister for rural development, Mr Jairam Ramesh (member of the Union Cabinet), will be the main speaker.

The venue is being provided by the India Habitat Centre which is co-hosting the public lecture. The event will be chaired by the Planning Commission Member in charge of health, Ms Syeda Hameed.

Around 100 guests from local and national authorities, civil society movements, NGOs, embassies and academia will be present, in addition to local media.

A buffet dinner will be served for all guests at 8 PM at the roof top terrace of the Habitat Centre.

9th November – Commission Meeting

Suggested Goals for the Meeting:

1. Developing recommendations

- Agree on value claims/prescriptive framework to guide the development of the recommendations
- Draft a set of recommendations based on the governance challenges/gaps identified at this stage

2. Decide on how to move forward with the Zero Draft

- Identify additional specific research needs to support the development of the recommendations
- Ensure conceptual clarity in a common vocabulary
- Agree on an analytical framework for global governance and health

09:00 – 09:45	Welcome by the Chair, the Vice Chair and The Royal Norwegian Embassy in Delhi	
09:45 – 10:30	Update by the Resource Group	
10:30 – 10:45	Break with refreshments	
10:45 – 12:30	Discussion <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Overall feedback/comments - Ensuring conceptual clarity 	
12.30 - 13.30	Lunch	
13.30 - 13.50	Introduction: Social Contracts: balancing the relations between global governance, the state and its citizens	Nkosana Moyo
13:50 – 14:50	Discussion in the Commission	
14:50 - 15:05	Break with refreshments	
15:05 – 15:25	Introduction: Value Claims for the Commission	Desmond McNeill
15:25 – 16:30	Discussion	
16:30 – 17:00	Summing up	

20:00 Dinner at a local restaurant

10th November – *Commission Meeting*

09:00 – 09:15 **Opening of meeting by Chair and Vice Chair**

09:15 – 10:00 **Presentation by Resource Group**

09:45 – 10:30 **Discussion**
- Feedback to the current state of analysis

10:30 – 10:45 **Break with refreshments**

10:45 – 11:05: **Introduction:** The level(s) of Recommendations and the aim of the Commission Sakiko Fukuda-Parr

11:05 -12:00 **Discussion**

12:00 – 13:00 **Lunch**

13:00 – 15:00 **Discussion about recommendations and identification of research needs**

15:00 – 15:30 **Reflections by The Youth Commission**

15:30 – 15:45 **Break with refreshments**

15:45 – 16:15 **Discussion about how to move forward**

16:15 – 16:30 **Summing up**

20:00 Dinner at The Claridges Hotel

2. List of Participants

The Lancet-University of Oslo Commission on Global Governance for Health
in Collaboration with Harvard Global Health Institute

- Third Meeting -

THE COMMISSION

Chair:

Ole Petter Ottersen, Rector of The University of Oslo, Norway

Vice-Chair:

Jashodhara Dasgupta, Coordinator of SAHAYOG, India

Virasakdi Chongsuvivatwong, Professor of Community Medicine at Prince of Songkla University, Thailand

Sakiko Fukuda-Parr, Professor of International Affairs at the New School, New York, USA

Rita Giacaman, Professor of Public Health and Research and Program Development Coordinator at the Institute of Community and Public Health, Birzeit University, Occupied Palestinian Territory

John Gyapong, Pro-Vice Chancellor of Research, Innovation and Development at the University of Ghana

Desmond McNeill, Director of the Research School at the Centre of Development and the Environment at the University of Oslo, Norway

Gertrude I. Mongella, Advocacy for Women in Africa (AWA), Tanzania

Nkosana Moyo, Founder and Executive Chairman of the Mandela Institute for Development Studies (MINDS), South Africa

Sigrun Møgedal, Special Adviser at the Norwegian Knowledge Centre for the Health Services, Norway

Ayanda Ntsaluba, Executive Director of Discovery Holdings, South Africa

Gorik Ooms, Postdoctoral Assistant at the Department of Public Health at the Institute of Tropical Medicine in Antwerp, Belgium

THE SECRETARIAT

Head

Inger B. Scheel, Head of the Secretariat of The Lancet-UiO Commission and of the Norwegian Forum for Global Health Research

Coordinator

Ann Louise Lie, Project Coordinator of The Lancet-UiO Commission

THE RESOURCE GROUP

Sidsel Roalkvam, Academic Director of the interfaculty research area; Livelihoods in Developing Countries, Centre for Development and the Environment, University of Oslo

Suerie Moon, Research Director and Co-Chair, Forum on Global Governance for Health, Harvard Global Health Institute and Harvard School of Public Health

Kristin I. Sandberg, Post.Doc at the Centre for Development and the Environment, University of Oslo

Jeanette H. Magnus, Head of the Institute of Health and Society, University of Oslo

Sverre Lie, MD, PhD, Special Adviser at the Department of Global Health at the Norwegian Directorate of Health

Larissa Stendie, Master Student and Research Assistant at the Centre for Development and the Environment, University of Oslo

YOUTH COMMISSION

Unni Gopinathan, Head of Youth Commission/Member of Resource Group and Medical Student, University of Oslo, Norway

Ramon Lorenzo Luis Rosa Guinto, Medical Doctor and regional coordinator for the Asia-Pacific and the Global Health Equity Initiative of the International Federation of Medical Students' Associations (IFMSA), The Philippines

Cristóbal Alfonso Cuadrado Nahum, Medical Doctor and Coordinator of "Health and Equity" Movement, Chile

DISTINGUISHED GUESTS AND SPEAKERS ON NOVEMBER 8TH

Advocate Anand Grover, UN Special Rapporteur on the Right to Health

Dr. P M Bhargava, Centre for Cellular and Molecular Biology (CCMB) Hyderabad

Dr. (Ms) Vandana Prasad, pediatrician and Member, National Commission for the Protection of Child Rights

Ms Leena Menghaney (Doctors without Borders)

Mr. Gopakumar KM (Third World Network)

Satinath (Sathyu) Sarangi (International Campaign for Justice in Bhopal)

Sarojini NB (SAMA)

Dr. Abhijit Das, Senior Health Activist

Ms Jaya Velankar, Senior Health Activist

Pradip Saha, Consultant

Ms Palasri Roy Das, Assistant Coordinator, SAHAYOG

Dr Bobby Kapur, Director of the Center for Globalization at Baylor College of Medicine, Houston, Texas